

Former Wurtsmith AFB
Restoration Advisory Board (RAB) Meeting
 30 August 2018
 5:30 – 7:57 p.m. Eastern Daylight Time
 Robert J. Parks Public Library
 6010 N. Skeel Ave., Oscoda Township, MI 48750

Final Meeting Minutes

Members Present	Organization
Tim Cummings	Oscoda Township
Robert Delaney	Michigan Department of Environmental Quality (MDEQ)
Abiy Mussa	Michigan Department of Health and Human Services (MDHHS)
Bill Gaines	Community Member
Arnie Leriche	Community Co-Chair
Chuck Lichon	District Health Department #2 (DHD2)
Matt Marrs	Air Force Civil Engineer Center/Air Force Co-Chair
Tony Martoglio	U.S. Department of Agriculture Forest Service (USFS)
Joe Maxwell	Community Member
Jeff Moss	AuSable Township
Mike Munson	Oscoda-Wurtsmith Airport Authority (OWAA)
Dan O'Connor (Alternate)	Community Member
Jerry Schmidt	Community Member
Dan Stock (Alternate)	Community Member
Robert Tasiar	Community Member
Aaron Weed (Alternate)	Oscoda Township
Cathy Wusterbarth	Community Member
Catherine Larive (Alternate)	Community Member
Joe Plunkey	Community Member
John Nordeen (alternate)	Oscoda Township
Irene Dunn (alternate)	Community Member
Jim Davis (Alternate)	Community Member
Matthew Hegwood	Community Member
Members Absent	Organization
Ryan Mertz	Community Member
Other Attendees	Organization
Saamih Bashir	AMEC (Air Force contractor)
Dale Corsi	DLZ (MDEQ contractor)
Jenny Haglund	Oscoda Press
Breanne Humphreys	Cherokee (Air Force contractor)
Bill Palmer	Trustee of Oscoda Township Board

Former Wurtsmith AFB Restoration Advisory Board Meeting

Final Meeting Minutes

30 August 2018

Paul Rekowski	AGEISS (Air Force contractor)
Troy Techlin	Saginaw Chippewa Indian Tribe
Greg Watson	Aerostar, LLC
Gene Kirvan	AuSable River Steelheaders, Lake Huron Sport Fishing
Jacob Bennett	Congressman Dan Kildee's office
Dave Winn	Resident
Lynn Winn	Resident
Dave O'Leary	
Tammy Newcomb	DNR
Darlene Abbott	Aerostar
Sue Leeming	MDEQ
Mike Jury	MDEQ
Bob Johnson	
Cheryl Johnson	
Nancy Silvey	
Michael Beiermeister	WBKB
Donna Tingley	Resident
Ross Tingley	Resident
Dave Schaeffer	
Lori Childers	Veterans and Civilians Clean Water Alliance
Mark Lee	Resident
Cathy Lee	Resident
Chris Coulon	NOW
Paula Bond	Aerostar
Facilitator	Organization
Malcolm McClendon	Air Force Installation and Mission Support Center

Attachments

Attachment 1: RAB Agenda

Attachment 2: Air Force Presentation

Attachment 3: MDEQ Presentation

Attachment 4: MDEQ Water Division Presentation

Attachment 5: NOW Activities

Attachment 6: Oscoda Fire Department Report

Attachment 7: RAB Evaluation

Attachment 8: Public Comment Card

Attachment 9: RAB Survey Feedback Summary

Link to video: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=pi8l2J628kg&t=1802s>

Welcome and Introductions

Mr. Malcolm McClendon, facilitator, began the RAB meeting at 5:30 pm and welcomed RAB members and others in attendance. He gave some opening remarks regarding his background and his objective as facilitator for the Wurtsmith RAB. RAB members took turns introducing themselves and the agencies they represent. Mr. McClendon introduced Mr. Matt Marris, the Air Force Co-Chair and the Base Realignment and Closure (BRAC) Environmental Coordinator (BEC). Mr. Marris welcomed the RAB members to the meeting, and thanked all agencies involved with delivering the new Benzene Arrow Street Granular Activated Carbon (GAC) Pump and Treat System (PTS). Mr. Arnie Leriche, Community Co-chair thanked the 15 community RAB members for reviewing reports and prioritizing issues for the "Community members "Updates" section. He also asked community to seek out the community members and communicate their concerns and questions and thanked the NOW group for sharing their concerns, comments and energy.

- Malcolm acknowledged attendance of certain dignitaries/VIPs: MI Representative Sue Allor, Congressman Kildee's District Office Mgr Jake Bennett and MDEQ Public Affairs rep. Scott Dean.

RAB Member Introductions

Greater than 50% of community RAB members, greater than 50% of government RAB members, and both co-chairs were present, so a quorum was present.

Stakeholder Updates

Oscoda Township (00h:08m:20s)

Mr. Tim Cummings asked Mr. Aaron Weed, Township Supervisor, to provide an update regarding an agreement between the Air Force and Township to use the Township's storm water system to discharge treated water. Mr. Weed said as of 3:25 p.m. today (Thursday, August 30, 2018) the Air Force provided the documents needed and that, as far as the Township is concerned, the Air Force is clear to use the storm water system to discharge treated water.

Tim Cummings asked if future RAB meetings would include a stakeholder update section, restoring the opportunity for all entities to speak at the beginning, Mr. Marris confirmed that the stakeholder update section would be restored for all future meetings as well.

Air Force (00h:10m:16s)

Mr. Marris said he and Dan Medina, a program manager with the Air Force Base Realignment and Closure Program, met with Mr. Weed to discuss progress and updates on various Wurtsmith restoration projects. He said the Air Force will continue to meet with Mr. Weed and other Township personnel during future site visits.

Referencing the newly completed Benzene Arrow Street Treatment Plant, Mr. Marris said the building was purposely constructed large enough to accommodate future expansion and increased treatment capacity, if necessary. He said the plant would begin operation the following day, Friday, August 31, 2018, treating water pumped from Arrow Street. Water pumped from the Benzene plant will begin GAC treatment once

those pipelines are in place. He said the Air Force would be working with MDEQ Water Division to establish the sampling and analysis plan.

Mr. Marrs said the Air Force will be looking at tying in the Mission Street Plant for treatment in 2019. He said the Air Force began talks with MDEQ this week about follow-on Performance-Based Contract (PBR) work. Mr. Marrs and his team are working with Mr. Bob Delaney, MDEQ, to assess sites and requirements as they work to put together a new task order for 2020.

Michigan Department of Environmental Quality (00h:13m:50s)

Mr. Delaney discussed a recently published Wurtsmith Capture Zone report that looked into whether or not veterans may have ingested PFAS-contaminated drinking water while stationed at Wurtsmith. He said they identified where municipal wells were located and compared them to where the known plumes are today, and then they ran their computer models to see if the water going into those wells passed through areas known to be contaminated today—he said the answer is yes, they could have been taking in PFAS, but they are unable to determine amount or concentrations consumed. That report is available on the MPART website:

https://www.michigan.gov/documents/pfasresponse/WAFB_Capture_Zone_Report_631415_7.pdf

Mr. Delaney said plume bounding work has been completed and the agency will release a report once a few more samples are completed and data analyzed. He noted that as they moved further from the base they did encounter smaller PFAS plumes that did not originate from the base.

Mr. Mike Jury highlighted the foam recovery effort—he said there's a link on the MDEQ website where people can submit reports regarding the presence of foam on Van Etten Lake. He said any report about amount, duration, etc. helps the MDEQ learn more about how things like weather patterns impact the presence of foam.

Mr. Bill Gaines provided an update regarding the school's efforts to tie into the municipal drinking water supply. He said they hoped the change would take place before the start of the school year, but that it will hopefully happen in September.

Mr. Jeff Moss asked how many times the MDEQ had collected foam since they put the collection plan in place. Mr. Jury said they have not received any significant reports to do a collection to date. They do plan to conduct further foam sampling to provide more data points.

Community RAB Member (00h:29m:30s)

Ms. Cathy Wusterbarth provided an update on NOW activities. NOW has conducted monthly meetings and attended several events and collaborated with other non-profit groups. She highlighted articles and other local and national news coverage NOW has participated in over the past few weeks.

Ms. Wusterbarth said NOW members are working with the National PFAS Contamination Coalition members regarding the failure of the State of Michigan to establish a forum for a regional EPA summit.

Attachment 5 provides an executive summary of NOW activities highlighted during the meeting.

Mr. Leriche presented his priority to develop a CERCLA-based project list with line items describing the requirements and current actions of all restoration and investigation sites. Mr. Leriche noted that in the past he has asked for the agencies to produce a joint product that compiles all line-item data. He said the community RAB members will develop their own list based on what they do know and work with the respective agencies to collect the information they need.

Mr. Marrs indicated that the large laminated maps provided to the RAB during the meeting are part of a concerted effort to more clearly communicate and explain the investigation and remediation work the Air Force is conducting across the entire base footprint.

Regarding ongoing sampling, Mr. Leriche said the RAB would like much more detailed information than is currently presented, including:

- What are the requirements of the three different agencies?
- What chemicals are being sampled by each?
- Where are they sampling?
- What is the sampling frequency?
- Who is conducting the sampling and who is overseeing it?
- When will the results be published?

Mr. Marrs said the Air Force is in the initial stages of discussing a feasible solution for meeting the Community RAB faction's request for a detailed project list. He said him and his team will continue to work with Mr. Leriche and other RAB community members to flesh out the details and obtain a clearer picture of the type of project tracker Mr. Leriche envisions.

Mr. Moss stated that he and other members of the community would like to see more emphasis on what's next instead of continuously hearing about what we already know.

Mr. Leriche plans to lead more work sessions to discuss and plan the development of the comprehensive project list.

Mr. Moss asked for the spreadsheet to be presented to the RAB at the next meeting as a working draft.

Mr. Bill Gaines, Community RAB member, said, from his perspective, of all the agencies that would be involved in contributing site information, MDEQ and MDHHS have significantly more and better data than provided by the Air Force. Mr. Leriche agreed, but pointed out that the Air Force doesn't have enough funding to do what MDEQ and MDHHS has been able to do.

Mr. Bob Delaney said that the RAB meeting might not be the best forum for a data dump due to the technical nature of the topic, but that a deep dive in a different, smaller forum might be a better solution.

Mr. Cummings objected to the base boundary line going through Clark's Marsh because the PFAS contamination went far beyond the boundary line into the marsh and continuing to the AuSable River. Mr. Tony Martoglio, U.S. Forest Service, and Mr. Leriche explained that the boundary line is a property line — not a boundary indicating contamination ownership. Mr. Martoglio and Mr. Marrs indicated the topic could be discussed in more detail.

Mr. Martoglio explained the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) regarding how the Air Force and U.S. Forest Service operate expires in November. That agreement is in the process of being renewed and he said he'd be able to share more details within another month or two.

MDHHS (00h:53m40s)

Mr. Abiy Mussa, an MDHHS contractor who is replacing Toxicologist Christina Bush on the board provided an update on fish sampling efforts. Mr. Mussa said the fish in Van Etten Lake with Do Not Eat Fish Advisories due to PFAS and Mercury includes Black Crappie, Large and Small-mouth Bass, Northern Pike and Walleye. Data on the Rock Bass are not yet available. For the AuSable River, Small Mouth Bass and Atlantic salmon were sampled and remain on the advisory list. There are additional fish sampling scheduled for Van Etten Lake and Cedar Lake.

Mr. Moss pointed out that the Oscoda area isn't standard and he requested MDHHS consider conducting annual sampling. An action item was recorded for the RAB Community Co-Chair to facilitate a written request for annual fish sampling to be submitted to MDHHS.

Technical Presentations

MDEQ (01h:01m:30s)

Mr. Delaney briefed ground and surface sampling and monitoring efforts for 2018. He said the sampling is part of MDEQs efforts to “bound” the plumes. (See attachment 3)

Mr. Delaney pointed out a smaller plume where sampling results indicate the source is not the Air Force — he said the chemicals are PFAS other than PFOS and PFOA.

The map presented by MDEQ included concentrations of all PFAS. Mr. Delaney reiterated that only PFOS/PFOA have associated health advisories at this time.

A member of the community asked about sampling efforts on the east side of Van Etten Lake. Mr. Delaney explained that ongoing sampling is primarily focused on areas that are not receiving alternate drinking water or filters.

Ms. Wusterbarth said according to the Township, the Huron Shore Regional Utility Authority (HRSUA) hadn't tested the municipal water supply since 2016. Mr. Delaney requested an AI to look into HRSUA water sampling schedule and results.

Mr. Tarek Buckmaster, supervisor for MDEQs Industrial and Storm Water Permits Unit, said the goal of the MDEQ Water Resource Division is to ensure Michigan's water are safe and clean for drinking, recreating, fishing, and healthy aquatic ecosystems. (See attachment 4)

Mr. Buckmaster highlighted the agencies authorities and Substantive Requirements Documents. Wurtsmith has been issued several SRDs over the years for surface and groundwater discharges. The SRD for the new GAC Treatment System includes water quality and treatment technology-based effluent limitations.

Mr. Bill Gaines asked who oversees untreated discharged water, like the Mission Street system that is currently pumping and discharging water without treatment. Mr. Buckmaster explained that in addition to the new system going into operation, the other systems that continue to pump water without treating it are still providing hydraulic control of PFOS/PFOA, protecting downgradient drinking water sources.

Mr. Moss asked if the department had received any request for remediation regarding Clark's Marsh. Mr. Buckmaster said he wasn't aware of any, but that FT-02 GAC PTS and the LF 30/31 Waste Water Treatment Plant both discharge treated water into the marsh.

A member of the community asked if the Air Force is responsible for monitoring its own discharge and reporting compliance. Mr. Buckmaster confirmed that the Air Force does conduct its own sampling; Mr. Robert Tasior asked if the MDEQ conducts periodic confirmation sampling, Mr. Buckmaster said they do.

An action item was recorded for both agencies (AF and MDEQ) to provide monitoring frequency requirements, permit process information and a sampling and analysis plan.

Air Force (01h:37m:40s)

Mr. Marrs and Mr. Saamih Bashir, Wood Plc, provided more background to help clarify confusion and answer questions raised about the Preliminary Assessment. This discussion addressed an action item from Mr. Gaines to answer specific site questions that challenged the thoroughness of the PA. Beginning with slide 8 (Attachment 2), they provided background on how they came to the conclusion that runways were never pre-foamed at Wurtsmith, research regarding an alleged A-6 plane crash that was documented as Area 10 in the Preliminary Assessment. Mr. Bashir explained that although Area 10 was not investigated by itself in the Site Inspection, SI sampling in other areas of the runway and adjacent are downgradient of Area 10 and their ongoing sampling efforts will chase any contamination upgradient until they reach the source.

A member of the community asked how deep the Air Force sampled in the sludge waste spreading area on the runway.

Mr. Delaney explained that PFAS attach to organic matter. Depending on the soil make-up, PFAS is not usually found in soil.

Mr. Marris provided a recap of 2018 restoration successes, including VOC removal, ongoing groundwater monitoring and monthly PTS discharge compliance sampling, installation of monitoring wells and vertical aquifer sampling borings, quarterly Drinking Water Monitoring Program sampling and a breakdown of groundwater remediation outcomes from the five treatment plants.

Mr. Martoglio asked for better context about treatment area/contamination/gallons being treated (context of impact of gallons treated per day).

A member of the community asked about sampling and ownership of contamination near the high school that likely stems from two emergency fire response where Aqueous Film Forming Foam was used to extinguish a petroleum fire. Mr. Marris said the Air Force is currently focused on mission-related contamination. Mr. Leriche said the RAB will look for a combined agency response from MDEQ and the Air Force regarding site responsibility. Mr. Marris said it would be helpful to have more information regarding both fire incidents.

Mr. Tasior said that the Oscoda Township Planning Commission is looking at expanding the growth of the community through their number one employer, Kalitta Air, and that they're looking at ways to expand housing. He said that there are housing development opportunities near Clark's Marsh and he asked if that site could potentially be re-prioritized to accommodate development. Mr. Marris said it possibly could be evaluated and an action item was recorded for the Airport Authority and Township to provide more information on prospective housing growth near Clark's Marsh.

Mr. Leriche proposed setting up a RAB-only conference call within the next month to discuss business items.

Public Comment

Mr. Bill Gaines (02h:20m:21s)

Mr. Gaines talked about the value of the largest fresh water source in the world—the Great Lakes. He said specifically called out in the Great Lakes Water Quality Agreement are PFOS and PFOA, as well as other long-chain PFAS. He highlighted the potential impacts addressed in the recently released health study. Mr. Gaines said the community needs to continue to push the EPA to take into account and enforce compliance with all communities and entities discharging PFAS contaminants into bodies of water that will eventually reach the Great Lakes—20 percent of the world's fresh water resources.

Mr. Greg Cole (02h:27m:20s)

Mr. Cole asked that the Air Force consider cost-sharing for future video streaming. He said that there's significant value in going back over the information after the meeting to try and absorb the information. An action item was recorded for the Air Force to follow up on.

Ms. Chris Coulon/Mr. Tony Spaniola (02h:32m:32s)

Ms. Coulon spoke on behalf of fellow NOW member, Mr. Spaniola. Mr. Spaniola asked for an update on the status of the dispute resolution (DR) process and the progress of stopping the bleeding of contaminants into Van Etten Lake. Mr. Delaney said everyone has been quite busy and he did not know the status of the DR and the people who know had just left the meeting, but he thinks that MDEQ

leadership is coordinating with the Air Force BRAC team to schedule their next dispute resolution meeting.

Mr. Robert Tasior (02h:35m:12s)

Mr. Tasior read a report on the October 18, 1995 fire in Oscoda. Mr. Tasior provided the report to Mr. Marrs for Air Force review. In summary, the memo said the Oscoda fire chief called the WDC caretaker manager and the Caretaker manager dispatched the caretaker fire department to the high school to assist in the fire fighting.

Conclusion

The RAB meeting adjourned at 7:57 p.m.